

Ivory Trade Restrictions and a Diminishing Elephant Population

In 1979 Africa had more than 1.3 million elephants. Today the population is approximately 415,000¹. Nearly a 70% decline in less than 40 years – almost completely due to ivory poaching. So you would think the sale of ivory would be completely illegal worldwide, right? Actually it depends on the country you're in.

Timeline

- 1979** More than 1.3 million elephants are roaming Africa.
- 1980's** Poachers kill approximately 200 elephants a day.
- 1988** African elephant population plummets to around 625,000 (50% decline in 10 years).
- 1989** CITES² lists all African elephants³ in Appendix I⁴ and bans all commercial international elephant ivory trade.⁵
- 1990's** After the 1989 ban, poaching slows to manageable levels.
- 1999** CITES allows Japan to legally buy almost 50 tons of stock-piled ivory in the 1st one-off sale.⁶
- 2000** After first one-off sale, EIA⁷ exposes how legal trade is used to launder illegal ivory and 90% of ivory sold in China came from illegal sources.⁸ EIA cautions any future one-off sales.
- 2002** China itself blames the one-off sale for increasing the illegal ivory smuggled to their shores.
- 2008** CITES allows China & Japan to legally buy 102 tons of stock-piled ivory in the 2nd one-off sale.⁶
- 2012** Immediately after the sale, China held on to most of its legal ivory, stimulating local demand and raising prices, thus increasing illegal ivory trade. After 4 years, poaching is now catastrophic as a result with 100,000 elephants slaughtered between 2010 and 2012.
- 2014** 25,000 forest elephants poached in last decade in Gabon's Minkébé National Park (80% decline).⁹ 144,000 savannah elephants poached in last 7 years across Africa (30% decline).¹⁰ Price of raw (unprocessed) ivory in China reaches peak of US\$2,100 per kilogram.¹¹
- 2015** China and the US announce an agreement to a "nearly complete ban" on ivory import/export and commercial domestic ivory trade¹² in both countries (no completion date given). Tanzania, one of the most important countries for elephants, lost 60% of their elephants in just 5 years.

¹ The population covers 37 countries (called "range states") in sub-Saharan Africa.

² CITES – Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wildlife Fauna and Flora

³ Asian elephants were put on Appendix 1 on July 1, 1975 and commercial international sale of their ivory has been banned since then.

⁴ Appendix I – the highest level of protection meaning a ban on all international sale and trade.

⁵ Need to clarify the inclusion of trade in antique ivory (before 1947); pre-Convention ivory (before 1976); and pre-ban ivory (before 1990). Also, since 1989 the populations of Botswana, Namibia, Zimbabwe and South Africa have been transferred back to Appendix II, but their ivory is still in Appendix I, so still included in ban.

⁶ [cites.org, Ivory auctions raise 15 million USD for elephant conservation, \(2008\)](https://www.cites.org/eng/news/pr/2008/081107_ivory.shtml). Retrieved from https://www.cites.org/eng/news/pr/2008/081107_ivory.shtml

⁷ EIA - Environmental Investigation Agency

⁸ Advocates of total ivory bans believe legal domestic ivory markets perpetuate illegal international trade because older, pre-ban ivory cannot easily be distinguished from poached ivory.

Note: All following footnotes contain source information only and are listed at the end of this document.

- 2016** **January:** Hong Kong pledges to a complete ban on commercial domestic ivory trade by 2021.
- June:** US passes new regulations that ban almost all domestic ivory trade.
- September:** IUCN¹³ World Conservation Congress results in international commitment to close domestic ivory markets. Four countries object - Canada, Namibia, South Africa & Japan.
- October:** CITES conference in Johannesburg fails to put all elephant populations in Appendix I by only 9 votes - Canada, US, UK, EU and others vote against it. However, Botswana, with the most elephants, reverses their pro-ivory trade policy and supports a total ban.
- 2017** **January:** Price of raw ivory in China falls to US\$730 per kilogram (65% drop in less 3 years) due to Chinese economic slowdown, anti-poaching team success and crackdown on corruption.
- February:** Draft EU guidance document indicates possible ban on raw ivory re-exports by July 1, 2017 to make sure that illegal tusks are not laundered with legal tusks.
- March:** China closes the first of its 67 licensed ivory carving factories and retailers, and promises to close its domestic ivory market by end of 2017.
- March:** Hong Kong says a bill on ivory trade will be introduced by end June. Hong Kong also convicts 2 people for illegal ivory possession, using radiocarbon dating to prove post-1990 ban.
- May:** EU announces it will suspend re-exports of raw ivory from July 1, 2017 even if it qualifies as “pre-Convention” ivory. EU recommends tougher scrutiny of worked ivory movement.
- May:** Japan revises its wildlife trade legislation - the Law for Conservation of Endangered Species – to tighten the registration of ivory businesses.¹²
- May:** EU Commission closes a potential loophole by issuing new guidance to block the export of raw ivory as outlined in its Action Plan Against Wildlife Trafficking made in 2016.¹³
- June:** Tokyo Police seize 18 ivory tusks at an antiques store, indicating Japan’s weak domestic ivory trade legislation.¹⁴
- November:** 29 member countries of the African Elephant Coalition call to end all trade in elephant ivory, highlighting the EU and Japan as playing active roles in the ivory trade.¹⁵
- 2018** **January:** Hong Kong closes a loophole in their ivory ban by outlawing all sales.
- April:** UK announces blanket ban on ivory trade, closing a loophole allowing antique ivory sales.
- April:** Taiwan announces it will close its domestic ivory trade market by 2020.¹⁶
- May:** UK introduces its Ivory Bill to Parliament. It is said to be the toughest domestic ivory trade ban in Europe and one of the toughest in the world.¹⁷
- August:** Jane Goodall Institute NZ calls on Conservation Minister to ban domestic ivory trade.¹⁸
- September:** An Australian bipartisan parliamentary committee recommends a national ban on the domestic trade of elephant ivory and rhino horn.¹⁹
- September:** An aerial survey by Elephants Without Borders reveals at least 87 elephant carcasses in Botswana. Government officials refute the claim of an increase in poaching.²⁰
- October:** China lifts its 25-year-ban on the trade of tiger bones and rhino horns.²¹
- November:** EU backtracks on a total ivory ban in Europe, despite it being the largest domestic market for ivory products in the world.²²

2019 January: Botswana's new president reverses the country's earlier stance to stop ivory sales and joins Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe in asking CITES to open up their ivory markets.²³

January: A report by international NGOs on Hong Kong's sizeable illegal wildlife trade, labels Macau as Hong Kong's major elephant tusk ivory trade port.²⁴

February: Elephants Without Borders claims the level of poaching in Botswana to be "unprecedented" after nearly 90 elephant carcasses were found during their aerial survey.²⁵

March: Kenya appeals to the EU to close its domestic market and end trophy imports in order to halt a decline in elephant population. The EU has the largest number of ivory traders.²⁶

March: China's ban on domestic ivory sales and ivory carving factories will not be enough to save the world's elephants if it does not address its booming illegal ivory trade.²⁷

May: Conservationists outraged at Botswana's decision to lift its 5-year elephant hunting ban.²⁸

May: Minnesota becomes 10th US state to prohibit ivory sales by law.²⁹ Other US states with similar laws are: New Jersey (August 2014), New York (June 2015), California (July 2016), Washington (January 2017), Oregon (May 2017), Hawaii (June 2017), Nevada (January 2018), Illinois (August 2018) and New Hampshire (January 2019).³⁰

July: Botswana, Namibia, Zambia and Zimbabwe, hosting 60% of Africa's elephants, want CITES to approve sale of their government ivory stocks and elephant hunting trophies.³¹

August: Singapore will ban domestic ivory sales from September 2021, removing a key market. In December 2018, a poll showed 99% of its residents supported the ban.³²

August: Israel announces closure of its domestic ivory market in elephant and mammoth ivory, and Australia announces its intent to close its market.³³

August: Australia announces a plan to ban its domestic trade in elephant ivory and rhino horn.

August: Different approaches to protecting elephants are set to dominate the debate at CITES CoP18 from August 17-28 with over 180 countries attending.³⁴

August: A coalition of 30 African elephant range states criticized Japan and EU's failure to close their domestic ivory markets as recommended at last CITES. Countries that have not banned their trade by next CITES must report back on the measures they are taking to do so.³⁵

September: CITES publishes an updated list of the decisions made on the proposals that took place at CITES CoP18 in Geneva.³⁶

September: NZ government releases a discussion document for public consultation, detailing options to regulate its domestic market for elephant ivory.³⁷

October: An op-ed by Zimbabwe Wildlife Department's head of research on his belief the CITES treaty structure is flawed, causing 9 Southern African nations to debate their membership.³⁸

November: Antique dealers in the UK fail to overturn the world's toughest ban on ivory trading. The UK high court rules the legislation does not breach European law.³⁹

December: Minnesota makes it illegal to trade in elephant tusks and rhinoceros' horns within the state's borders as of January 1, 2020.⁴⁰

December: A 2019 study showed a decline in annual poaching mortality rate from a peak of >10% in 2011 to <4% in 2017. However, the current poaching rate is still unsustainable and threatens the survival of elephants.⁶⁵

2020 January: China announces an immediate temporary ban on the sale of wildlife in markets, restaurants and online as part of an effort to contain the Coronavirus outbreak.⁴¹

February: Botswana auctions the trophy hunting of 60 elephants to locals, ending a 5-year ban. A total of 272 elephants will be trophy hunted this year.⁴²

February: China permanently bans wildlife trade and consumption, but not the use of wildlife for fur, medicine or research. This creates a loophole for illegal trafficking of wildlife.⁴³

March: First worldwide news coverage of Covid-19. Video on how the wildlife trade is linked to coronavirus⁴⁴ and John Scanlon's article on the high response needed to end wildlife crime.⁴⁵

April: Washington DC bans the sale of elephant ivory and rhino horn within its boundaries.⁴⁶

April: Covid/Wildlife - Article on why China's wildlife ban is not enough to stop another virus outbreak⁴⁷, article on wildlife trafficking soaring due to unchecked Africa hubs⁴⁸ and an article on the species threatened by traditional Chinese medicine.⁴⁹

May: California bill restricting wildlife trade and protecting endangered species passes first Committee hearing.⁵⁰

June: Covid/Wildlife - Article on a step to preventing wildlife-related pandemics.⁵¹

July: A UN report states the world ivory market shrunk between 2014 and 2018, while the pangolin market soared. The price of ivory in China fell by more than half in these 4 years. The annual income from ivory trafficking between 2016 and 2018 is estimated at \$400 million.⁵²

July: A new portable DNA assay (procedure for measuring the presence and amount of a target substance) could revolutionise the way border officials examine suspected wildlife products.⁵³

July: Covid/Wildlife - Vietnam bans wildlife imports and will close markets due to pandemic⁵⁴ while China's traditional medicines still contain wildlife.⁵⁵

August: CITES, WWF and TRAFFIC release new guide to identify smuggled ivory.⁵⁶

August: Singapore crushes 9 tonnes of elephant ivory worth \$18 M and launches Centre for Wildlife Forensics to increase detection of illegal wildlife.⁵⁷

September: World Wildlife Fund's Living Planet Report states worldwide animal populations declined nearly 70% in just 50 years. Almost 4,400 species of monitored animals around the world, have declined an average of 68% between 1970 and 2016.⁵⁸

September: US Sen. Dan Sullivan introduces a bill for 3rd year which would hinder the ability of states to create laws fighting the illegal ivory trade.⁵⁹ (IvoryFreeCanada mentioned.)

September: New Zealand commits to amending its Trade in Endangered Species Act effectively banning the domestic sale of elephant ivory from elephants killed after 1975.⁶⁰

October: TRAFFIC launches ETIS Online (Elephant Trade Information System Online), a database website designed to bolster the collection of elephant ivory seizure data.⁶¹

October: Australian scientist uses DNA technology to develop new test - 100% accurate in identifying the origins of ivory pieces and thereby where ivory poachers are operating.⁶²

November: Covid/Wildlife - China's revised Wildlife Protection Law bans breeding/trade of most wild animals for food consumption, but still allows trade for traditional medicine.⁶³

December: Bill S-218 Jane Goodall Act (proposed Nov 17/2020) besides protecting elephants in captivity, would also ban the import of elephant ivory and hunting trophies into Canada.⁶⁴

2021 January: New study finds ivory still regularly traded on eBay, despite them making it illegal. In study, eBay only removed between 1.3% and 6.9% of listings selling ivory.⁶⁶

January: For decades, Africa's ivory and illegal wildlife trade was clustered in Kenya and Tanzania. Since 2014, the epicentre of smuggling has shifted west to Nigeria.⁶⁷

January: Covid/Wildlife - Despite Covid restrictions, Uganda is a source, transit node and regional hub for illegal wildlife trade - pangolin scales and elephant penises (delicacy and TCM) – mainly from Uganda's Queen Elizabeth Nat Park and DR Congo's Garamba Nat Park.⁶⁸

February: Wildlife trade, both legal and illegal, is the biggest threat to global biodiversity conservation. In 2011 alone, approx 1 of every 12 African elephants was killed by a poacher.⁶⁹

March: IUCN upgrades African elephant listing from “vulnerable” to 2 species: savannah elephant as “endangered” (fell 60% in last 50 years), and forest elephant as “critically endangered” (it fell 86% in last 31 years). A 2016 survey found 415,000 forest & savanna elephants in Africa. Vulnerable: fell over 30% in 3 generations; Endangered: fell over 50% in 3 generations; Critically Endangered: fell over 80% in 3 generations.⁷⁰

March: Japan's legal (domestic) ivory market is a major supply for illegal export and a cover for illegal import to Japan. EIA confirmed at least 76 ivory shipments from Japan were seized in other countries (mainly China) from 2018 to 2020. TRAFFIC, identified 380 seizure cases during 2019 between China, Japan and 2 other Asian countries. Japan to China was most common route. Recent survey of 422 Chinese who went to Japan - 19% planned to purchase ivory and 52% knew bringing ivory into China was illegal.⁷¹

March: Sen. Stern proposes Bill 376 requiring anyone importing or exporting wildlife into/from California, to ensure no risk of an incurable, zoonotic disease resulting from the wildlife.⁷²

April: Elephants face extinction in Ivory Coast where numbers decreased 50% in last 30 years. There were 100,000 in 1960 and less than 500 now due to poaching and cocoa plantations.⁷³

May: UK tabled a raft of legislation to declare animals as sentient, halt most live exports, ban ivory and shark fin sales and import of wild trophies from endangered species.⁷⁴

May: New bill seeks to end Hong Kong days as an illegal wildlife trade hub.⁷⁵

June: Nations race to crush poachers by closing ivory trade loopholes.⁷⁶

July: Government seeks to extend protection of ivory bearing animals.⁷⁷

July: Canada launches consultation on stricter measures for elephant ivory trade.⁷⁸

August: Hong Kong adds wildlife trafficking to organized crime law.⁷⁹

September: Singapore to ban domestic trade in elephant ivory from September 2021.⁸⁰

September: IUCN votes against ReconAfrica exploration. The International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) has called on Botswana and Namibia to increase scrutiny of oil and gas plans in the Okavango Delta.⁸¹

September: Statement on trade in live African elephants under Articles III and IV of the Convention.⁸²

October: Prince Harry launches campaign to halt drilling in Okavango Delta, Africa.⁸³

December: Hong Kong ban on ivory sales comes into force.⁸⁵

2022 January: A total ban on commercial trade in ivory comes into effect in Hong Kong SAR. ⁸⁶

February: Woolly mammoth mining in Siberia concern it mixes with illegal ivory. ⁸⁷

March: Japan's tireless ivory market a traders haven free of strict controls. ⁸⁸

March: Legal opinion on CITES rules on exports of live African elephants from Namibia. ⁸⁹

March: Antiquities dealers appeal New York ivory ban. ⁹⁰

March: Canadian Senator proposes bill to ban captivity of certain animals and protect others. JG Act of 2020 ⁹¹

March: Proposed law banning import of hunting trophies to be scrapped – UK. ⁹²

April: US allows hunters to import some elephant trophies from African countries. ⁹³

May: UN moves towards crackdown on illegal wildlife trade in historic resolution ⁹⁴

May: Ivory ban loophole means elephant body parts can still be traded in UK. ⁹⁵

June: Zimbabwe's elephant summit fails to rally continent wide support for a renewed legal ivory trade. ⁹⁶

July: Joint NGO statement welcoming the implementation of UK Ivory Act. ⁹⁷

October: Ivory seized decades ago still turning up in raids. ⁹⁸

November: Ivory trade: Reports show smugglers benefitting from legal ivory trade. ⁹⁹

November: Poaching on the rise, but CITES COP19 downgrades status of southern white rhinos. ¹⁰⁰

November: CITES COP19 – an overall win for wildlife with greater commitments to protect a variety of species. ¹⁰¹

December: Poacher's target hippos for giant teeth in place of ivory. ¹⁰²

2023 January: Guest article: Elephants in the room: CITES and African elephants. ¹⁰³

March: Bill banning import of trophy hunts into UK passed by Mps. ¹⁰⁴

May: Ivory ban to extend to hippos and killer whales UK. ¹⁰⁵

June: Breaking: Government of Canada advances ban on elephant ivory. ¹⁰⁶

Appendices (from #9 onwards)

- 9 V Morell, *No place is safe for Africa's hunted forest elephants*, (2017). Retrieved from <https://www.sciencemag.org/news/2017/02/no-place-safe-africa-s-hunted-forest-elephants>
- 10 MJ Chase, S Schlossberg, CR Griffin, PJC Bouché, SW Djene, PW Elkan, S Ferreira, F Grossman, EM Kohi, K Landen, P Omondi, A Peltier, SAJ Selier, R Sutcliffe, *Continent-wide survey reveals massive decline in African savannah elephants*, (2016). Retrieved from <https://peerj.com/articles/2354/> The findings of this report, dubbed The Great Elephant Census, were announced at the 2016 IUCN World Conservation Congress.
- 11 L Vigne, E Martin, *China Faces A Conservation Challenge: The Expanding Elephant and Mammoth Ivory Trade in Beijing and Shanghai*, (2014). Retrieved from http://savetheelephants.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/2014_ChinaConservationChallenge.pdf
- 12 traffic.org, *TRAFFIC surveys find thousands of ivory items sold weekly online in Japan*, (2017). Retrieved from www.traffic.org/publications/reports/traffic-surveys-find-thousands-of-ivory-items-sold-weekly-online-in-japan/
- 13 europa.eu, *Commission introduces new measures to fight poaching and to end trade in raw ivory*, (2017). Retrieved from http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release_IP-17-1308_en.htm
- 14 traffic.org, *Ivory seizure exposes Japan's lax ivory trade controls*, (2017). Retrieved from <https://www.traffic.org/news/ivory-seizure-exposes-japans-lax-domestic-ivory-trade-controls/>
- 15 JT Steinmetz, *African nations urged to end all trade in elephant ivory*, (2017). Retrieved from <https://www.eturbonews.com/171538/african-nations-urged-end-trade-elephant-ivory>
- 16 traffic.org, *Taiwan moves to close its domestic ivory market by 2020*, (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.traffic.org/news/taiwan-announces-move-to-close-its-domestic-ivory-market-by-2020/>
- 17 eia-international.org, *UK Gov't publishes its Bill to shut down the country's domestic trade in ivory*, (2018). Retrieved from <https://eia-international.org/uk-govt-publishes-bill-shut-countrys-domestic-trade-ivory/>
- 18 janegoodall.org.nz, *Killing the New Zealand Trade in Ivory*, (2018). Retrieved from <http://www.janegoodall.org.nz/press-room-1/>
- 19 theguardian.com, *Bipartisan inquiry recommends Australia ban domestic ivory trade*, (2018). Retrieved from www.theguardian.com/environment/2018/sep/19/bipartisan-inquiry-recommends-australia-ban-domestic-ivory-trade
- 20 theguardian.com, *Botswana rejects claims of elephant poaching surge*, (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/sep/20/botswana-rejects-claims-of-elephant-poaching-surge>
- 21 ft.com, *China lifts ban on trade of tiger bones and rhino horns*, (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.ft.com/content/233edade-dbf1-11e8-9f04-38d397e6661c>
- 22 independent.co.uk, *EU backtracks on total ivory ban despite massive pressure from campaigners and MEPs*, (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.independent.co.uk/environment/eu-ivory-ban-elephants-poaching-wildlife-trafficking-catherine-bearder-avaaz-a8622471.html>
- 23 sundaystandard.info, *Botswana backtracks stance on ivory sales*, (2019). Retrieved from <http://www.sundaystandard.info/botswana-backtracks-stance-ivory-sales>
- 24 macuabusiness.com, *Report on Hong Kong's illegal wildlife trade points to Macau as shipping port for ivory crime syndicates*, (2019). Retrieved from <http://www.macuabusiness.com/macau-report-on-hong-kongs-illegal-wildlife-trade-points-macau-as-shipping-port-for-ivory-crime-syndicates/>
- 25 cnn.com, *Botswana has 'significant elephant-poaching problem,' conservation group says*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.cnn.com/2019/02/25/africa/botswana-elephant-poaching-intl/index.html>
- 26 iol.co.za, *Kenya urges EU to end ivory trade amid threats to iconic species*, (2019). Retrieved from www.iol.co.za/business-report/international/kenya-urges-eu-to-end-ivory-trade-amid-threats-to-iconic-species-19659975

- 27 thediplomat.com, *China's ivory ban a work in progress*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://thediplomat.com/2019/03/chinas-ivory-ban-a-work-in-progress/>
- 28 theguardian.com, *Botswana lifts ban on hunting elephants*, (2019). Retrieved from www.theguardian.com/world/2019/may/23/botswana-lifts-ban-on-hunting-elephants?CMP=share_btn_link
- 29 humanesociety.org, *Media statement on Governor Walz's signing of state law in Minnesota prohibiting sale of ivory and rhino horn*, (2019). Retrieved from www.humanesociety.org/news/media-statement-governor-walzs-signing-state-law-minnesota-prohibiting-sale-ivory-and-rhino
- 30 aaps-journal.org, *States banning the sale of fossil ivory and proposed legislation*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.aaps-journal.org/Fossil-Ivory-Legislation.html>
- 31 news.mongabay.com, *"Let us trade": Debate over ivory sales rages ahead of CITES*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://news.mongabay.com/2019/07/let-us-trade-debate-over-ivory-sales-rages-ahead-of-cites-summit/>
- 32 dw.com, *Singapore to ban domestic elephant ivory trade*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.dw.com/en/singapore-to-ban-domestic-elephant-ivory-trade/a-49993890>
- 33 hsi.org, *CITES continues to apply pressure on remaining legal ivory markets, reiterating commitment to closure of domestic ivory markets*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.hsi.org/news-media/cites-commitment-close-domestic-ivory-markets/>
- 34 bbc.com, *Elephant protection debate to dominate conservation meeting*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.bbc.com/news/science-environment-49372409>
- 35 ifaw.org, *Governments urged to act on domestic ivory markets*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.ifaw.org/international/news/governments-urged-to-act-on-domestic-ivory-markets>
- 36 cites.org, *Updates on decisions made on proposals to amend Appendices I & II at CoP18*, (2019). Retrieved from https://cites.org/eng/updates_decisions_cop18_species_proposals
- 37 rnz.co.nz, *NZ government targets ivory trade regulations*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.rnz.co.nz/news/national/399459/nz-government-targets-ivory-trade-regulations>
- 38 dailymaverick.co.za, *CITES a flawed convention that does wildlife conservation no favours*, (2019). Retrieved from www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2019-10-23-cites-a-flawed-convention-that-does-wildlife-conservation-no-favours/
- 39 theguardian.com, *'Fantastic day for elephants': court rejects ivory ban challenge*, (2019). Retrieved from www.theguardian.com/environment/2019/nov/05/fantastic-day-for-elephants-court-rejects-ivory-ban-challenge
- 40 startribune.com, *2020 brings new laws to Minnesota*, (2019). Retrieved from <https://www.startribune.com/2020-brings-new-laws-to-minnesota/566538792/>
- 41 news.mongabay.com, *Conservationists welcome China's wildlife trade ban*, (2020). Retrieved from https://news.mongabay.com/2020/01/conservationists-welcome-chinas-wildlife-trade-ban/?fbclid=IwAR3MITsPS8g_vTiFDU3WH9lwlwNLG3ybqWuq-JHoOy8h5xJTBNjUQ7LBWVQ--
- 42 humanesociety.org, *Botswana sells 60 elephants for trophy hunts at first auction since it ended ban*, (2020). www.blog.humanesociety.org/2020/02/botswana-sells-60-elephants-for-trophy-hunts-at-first-auction-since-it-ended-ban.html
- 43 nytimes.com, *China's Ban on wildlife trade a big step, but has loopholes, conservationists say*, (2020). <https://www.nytimes.com/2020/02/27/science/coronavirus-pangolin-wildlife-ban-china.html>
- 44 Vox, *How wildlife trade is linked to coronavirus*, (2020). Retrieved from: <https://youtu.be/TPpoJGYIW54>.
- 45 linkedin.com, *To end wildlife crime global responses must move with the times*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/end-wildlife-crime-global-responses-must-move-times-scanlon-ao/>
- 46 livekindly.co, *Washington DC just banned the sale of elephant ivory and rhino horn*, (2020). Retrieved from https://www.livekindly.co/washington-dc-banned-elephant-ivory-rhino-horn/?fbclid=IwAR3AoxAU8RIW1oZW_wuHhmaAIyPJFgFFmODAOHIQ2uVdkrIRc_mu-UOehYs
- 47 latimes.com, *Why China's wildlife ban is not enough to stop another virus outbreak*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://www.latimes.com/world-nation/story/2020-04-02/why-china-wildlife-ban-not-enough-stop-coronavirus-outbreak>

- 48 iol.co.za, *Wildlife trafficking soars as illegal dealers use unchecked hubs in southern Africa* (2020). Retrieved <https://www.iol.co.za/saturday-star/news/wildlife-trafficking-soars-as-illegal-dealers-use-unchecked-hubs-in-southern-africa-46980261>
- 49 china-underground.com, *Traditional Chinese Medicine Animals: a list of species threatened by TCM*, (2018). Retrieved from <https://china-underground.com/2018/07/07/traditional-chinese-medicine-animals/>
- 50 worldanimalnews.com, *Critical California Bill That Will Restrict Exotic Wildlife Trade & Protect Endangered Species Passes First Committee Hearing With A Vote of 5-1*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://worldanimalnews.com/breaking-critical-california-bill-that-will-restrict-exotic-wildlife-trade-protect-endangered-species-passes-first-committee-hearing-with-a-vote-of-5-1/?fbclid=IwAR3gOnpjC-5HRUyXR4QOOhMevU47s7cDoutCXxBmFm9EC44Br5G4RBneEVWA>
- 51 scientificamerican.com, *A Crucial Step Toward Preventing Wildlife-Related Pandemics*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://www.scientificamerican.com/article/a-crucial-step-toward-preventing-wildlife-related-pandemics/>
- 52 africanelephantjournal.com, *Illegal Ivory Trade Shrinks While Pangolin Trafficking Booms, UN Says*, (2020). <https://africanelephantjournal.com/illegal-ivory-trade-shrinks-while-pangolin-trafficking-booms-u-n-says/>
- 53 geographical.co.uk, *DNA sequencing device could rapidly detect illegal wildlife products*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://geographical.co.uk/nature/wildlife/item/3760-dna-sequencing-device-could-rapidly-detect-illegal-wildlife-products>
- 54 globalnews.com, *Vietnam bans wildlife trade over coronavirus pandemic fears*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://globalnews.ca/news/7213318/coronavirus-vietnam-wildlife-trade/>
- 55 express.co.uk, *'Not banned it at all!' China's latest medicine list STILL includes wildlife ingredients*, (2020). <https://www.express.co.uk/news/world/1308762/china-wildlife-trade-traditional-medicine-pangolin-scales-illegal-trade-coronavirus-spt?fbclid=IwARokbCUXmSc3lV5XV-1k19H8WkOdyu1Con93I5f-dgDCtd2kcaYm8SI28k>
- 56 cites.org, *CITES, WWF and TRAFFIC release new guide to identify smuggled ivory*, (2020). Retrieved from https://cites.org/eng/CITES_WWF_TRAFFIC_Ivory_Identification_Guide_11082020
- 57 straitstimes.com, *\$18 million worth of ivory to be destroyed; NParks launches new centre to combat illegal wildlife trade*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/environment/18-million-worth-of-ivory-to-be-destroyed-nparks-launches-new-centre-to-combat>
- 58 cbsnews.com, *Animal populations worldwide declined nearly 70% in just 50 years, new report says* (2020). <https://www.cbsnews.com/news/endangered-species-animal-population-decline-world-wildlife-fund-new-report/>
- 59 humansociety.org, *A U.S. Senator attacks states' efforts to end ivory trafficking, but progress continues on many fronts*, (2020). https://blog.humansociety.org/2020/09/a-u-s-senator-attacks-states-efforts-to-end-ivory-trafficking-but-progress-continues-on-many-fronts.html?credit=blog_post_091620_idhome-page
- 60 africanelephantjournal.com, *'A big step forward' – Government announces plan to ban sale of elephant ivory in NZ*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://africanelephantjournal.com/a-big-step-forward-government-announces-plan-to-ban-sale-of-elephant-ivory-in-nz/>
- 61 cites.org, *TRAFFIC launches Elephant Trade Information System Online*, (2020). Retrieved from https://cites.org/eng/CITES_TRAFFIC_launch_ETISonline_15102020
- 62 Australian Associated Press, *DNA sleuths targeting ivory poachers*, (2020). Retrieved from <https://au.news.yahoo.com/dna-sleuths-targeting-ivory-poachers-010956373--spt.html?guccounter=2>
- 63 eia.org, *Confirmed: China's revised wildlife law a grave missed opportunity for threatened wildlife*, (2020). <https://eia-international.org/news/confirmed-chinas-revised-wildlife-law-is-currently-a-grave-missed-opportunity-for-threatened-wildlife>
- 64 thelawyersdaily.ca, *What Jane Goodall Act could mean for animals*, (2020). Retrieved May 3, 2021 - www.thelawyersdaily.ca/business/articles/22832/what-jane-goodall-act-could-mean-for-animals
- 65 bbc.com, *Ivory: Elephant decline revealed by shipwreck cargo*, (2020). Retrieved May 3, 2020 - <https://www.bbc.com/news/science-environment-55340975>
- 66 mongabay.com - *Ivory by any other name: Illegal trade thrives on eBay, study finds*, (2021). Retrieved May 3, 2020 <https://news.mongabay.com/2021/01/ivory-by-any-other-name-illegal-trade-thrives-on-ebay-study-finds/>

- 67 mongabay.com, *Nigeria emerges as Africa's primary export hub for ivory, pangolin scales*, (2021). Retrieved <https://news.mongabay.com/2021/01/nigeria-emerges-as-africas-primary-export-hub-for-ivory-pangolin-scales>
- 68 dailymaverick.co.za, *Uganda's illegal wildlife traders undeterred by Covid-19 restrictions*, (2021). Retrieved <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2021-01-25-ugandas-illegal-wildlife-traders-undeterred-by-covid-19>
- 69 dailymaverick.co.za, *Wildlife trade – legal and illegal – is the biggest threat to global biodiversity conservation* (2021). <https://dailymaverick.co.za/article/2021-02-11-wildlife-trade-legal-and-illegal-is-the-biggest-threat-to-global-biodiversity-conservation/>
- 70 iucn.org, *African elephant species now Endangered and Critically Endangered - IUCN Red List*, (2021). Retrieved <https://iucn.org/news/species/202103/african-elephant-species-now-endangered-and-critically-endangered-iucn-red-list>
- 71 africanelephantjournal.com, *Tokyo Ivory: Catering to International Orders*, (2021). Retrieved May 3, 2021 from <https://africanelephantjournal.com/tokyo-ivory-catering-to-international-orders/>
- 72 signalscv.com, *Stern targets future pandemics with wildlife-trafficking bill*, (2021). Retrieved May 3, 2021 from <https://signalscv.com/2021/03/stern-targets-future-pandemics-with-wildlife-trafficking-bill/>
- 73 phys.org, *Ivory Coast sounds alarm over plunging elephant population*, (2021). Retrieved May 3, 2021 from <https://phys.org/news/2021-04-ivory-coast-alarm-plunging-elephant.html>
- 74 dailymaverick.co.za, *UK tabled a raft of legislation for animals* (2021) <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2021-05-12-uk-to-recognise-animals-as-sentient-and-ban-trophy-imports/>
- 75 Mongabay.com – *new bill seeks to end Hong Kong as illegal wildlife hub*, (2021) <https://news.mongabay.com/2021/05/new-bill-seeks-to-end-hong-kongs-days-as-an-illegal-wildlife-trade-hub/>
- 76 borneobulletin.com.bn, *Nations race to crush poachers by closing ivory trade loopholes*. (2021) <https://borneobulletin.com.bn/nations-race-to-crush-poachers-by-closing-ivory-trade-loopholes/>
- 77 The Guardian.com/environment, *seeks to extend protection of ivory bearing animals* (2021) <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2021/jul/17/uk-government-seeks-to-extend-protection-of-ivory-bearing-animals>
- 78 Newswire.ca/newsreleases, (2021) *Canada launches consultation on stricter measures for elephant ivory trade*. (2021) <https://www.newswire.ca/news-releases/canada-launches-consultation-on-stricter-measures-for-elephant-ivory-trade-800318175.html>
- 79 france24.com/en/live-news, (2021) *Hong Kong adds wildlife trafficking to organized crime law*. <https://www.france24.com/en/live-news/20210818-hong-kong-adds-wildlife-trafficking-to-organised-crime-law>
- 80 straitstimes.com/Singapore, (2021) *Singapore to ban domestic trade in elephant ivory from September 2021* <https://www.straitstimes.com/singapore/singapore-to-ban-domestic-trade-in-elephant-ivory-from-september-2021>
- 81 energyvoice.com/oilandgass/Africa, (2021) <https://www.energyvoice.com/oilandgas/africa/ep-africa/349190/iucn-namibia-botswana-eias/>
- 82 cites.org/eng/Statement, (2021) *Statement on trade in live African elephants under Articles III and IV of the Convention*. [https://cites.org/eng/Statement trade elephants CITES articles3 4 17 sep 17092021](https://cites.org/eng/Statement%20trade%20elephants%20CITES%20articles%203%204%2017%20sep%2017092021)
- 83 archewell.com/news/(2021) *Prince Harry launches campaign to halt drilling in Okavango Delta, Africa* https://archewell.com/news/prince-harry-launches-global-campaign-to-halt-drilling-in-africas-okavango-river-basin/?fbclid=IwAR2D9cLfz4oGCIO-T3Brpc6PAhDzfp7jISalvoFgFfhvlf_pCSwoISzYkes
- 84 scmp.com/news, (2021) *China's ivory ban risk legal online trade in woolly mammoth tusks* <https://www.scmp.com/news/china/science/article/3154702/chinas-ivory-ban-risk-legal-online-trade-woolly-mammoth-tusks>
- 85 Hong Kong ban on ivory sales comes into force. (2021) <https://africanelephantjournal.com/hong-kong-ban-on-ivory-sales-comes-into-force/>

- ⁸⁶ IFAW.org/news (2022) - A total ban in commercial trade in ivory comes into effect in Hong Kong SAR https://www.ifaw.org/news/hong-kong-ivory-ban?utm_source=SFMC&utm_medium=email&ms=UONDN220140002&cid=7013k000001a2XD&fbclid=IwAR3vUOZEfIasXrrOEU2RmrLeSQNt_zlxv-PPmpEg7lg-meJOD7MfKOiOO14
- ⁸⁷ abc.net.au/news/science (2022) Woolly mammoth mining in Siberia - There is concern that elephant ivory could be passed off as mammoth. <https://www.abc.net.au/news/science/2022-02-06/woolly-mammoth-mining-siberia-ethical-ivory/100763684>
- ⁸⁸ africanelephantjournal.com, Japan's tireless ivory market a traders haven free of strict controls (2022) <https://africanelephantjournal.com/japans-tireless-ivory-market-a-traders-haven-free-of-strict-controls/>
- ⁸⁹ Africanjournal.com, (2022) Legal opinion on CITES rules on exports of live African elephants from Namibia <https://africanelephantjournal.com/legal-opinion-on-cites-rules-on-exports-of-live-african-elephants-from-namibia/>
- ⁹⁰ thenewspaper.com/2022, Antiquities dealers appeal New York ivory ban. <https://www.theartnewspaper.com/2022/03/07/antiquities-dealers-appeal-new-york-ivory-ban>
- ⁹¹ ctvnews.ca/mobile/politics, 2022, Senator proposes bill to ban captivity of certain animals and protect others <https://www.ctvnews.ca/mobile/politics/senator-proposes-bill-to-ban-captivity-of-certain-animals-protect-others-1.5828989>
- ⁹² theguardian.com/world, 2022 , Proposed law banning import of hunting trophies to be scrapped. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2022/mar/14/proposed-law-banning-import-of-hunting-trophies-to-be-scrapped>
- ⁹³ nytimes.com,2022, science - US allows hunters to import some elephant trophies from African countries <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/04/01/science/elephant-trophies-hunting.html>
- ⁹⁴ <https://www.thecanary.co/global/world-news/2022/05/23/un-moves-towards-crackdown-on-illegal-wildlife-trade-in-historic-resolution/>
- ⁹⁵ <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2022/may/27/ivory-ban-loophole-means-elephant-body-parts-can-still-be-traded-in-uk>
- ⁹⁶ <https://eia-international.org/news/zimbabwes-elephant-summit-fails-to-rally-continent-wide-support-for-a-renewed-legal-ivory-trade/>
- ⁹⁷ <https://eia-international.org/news/joint-ngo-statement-welcoming-the-implementation-of-the-uk-ivory-act-in-effect-from-today/>
- ⁹⁸ <https://www-bbc-co-uk.cdn.ampproject.org/c/s/www.bbc.co.uk/news/science-environment-63288389.amp>
- ⁹⁹ <https://www.thecanary.co/global/world-analysis/2022/11/03/legal-ivory-trade-benefits-smugglers-while-endangering-elephants-new-report-finds/>
- ¹⁰⁰ <https://www.downtoearth.org.in/news/africa/poaching-on-the-rise-but-cites-cop19-downgrades-status-of-southern-white-rhino-86199>
- ¹⁰¹ <https://eia-international.org/news/cites-cop19-an-overall-win-for-wildlife-with-greater-commitments-to-protect-a-variety-of-species/>
- ¹⁰² <https://www-bbc-com.cdn.ampproject.org/c/s/www.bbc.com/news/science-environment-63931103.amp>
- ¹⁰³ <https://sdg.iisd.org/commentary/guest-articles/elephant-in-the-room-cites-and-african-elephants/>

104 <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2023/mar/17/bill-banning-import-of-hunting-trophies-into-uk-passed-by-mps>

105 <https://www.bbc.com/news/science-environment-65673951>

106 <https://www.hsi.org/news-resources/breaking-government-of-canada-advances-ban-on-elephant-ivory-and-rhino>

